

**Cross-Party Group in the Scottish Parliament
on Palliative Care**

Convener
Michael McMahon MSP

Vice Conveners
Roseanna Cunningham MSP
Jamie McGrigor MSP

Secretary
Patricia Wallace

**Approved minute of the meeting of the Cross-Party Group
on Palliative Care in the Scottish Parliament**

**Wednesday 7 January 2009 at 5.45 pm
Committee Room 4, Scottish Parliament Headquarters**

Present:

Michael McMahon MSP (convener)	Hamilton North & Bellshill
Roseanna Cunningham MSP	Perth
Helen Eadie MSP	Dunfermline East
Cathy Jamieson MSP	Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley
Ian McKee MSP	Lothians
Dr Richard Simpson MSP	Mid Scotland
David Thomson MSP	Highlands and Islands
Joan Adam	St Columba's Hospice
Ian Armstrong	Marie Curie Cancer Care
Dr Fred Benton	St Columba's Hospice
Maureen Black	Macmillan Cancer Support
Lynda Blue	British Heart Foundation
Derek Blues	NHS Forth Valley
Dr Duncan Brown	St Columba's Hospice
Elaine Burt	NHS Greater Glasgow & Clyde
Sandra Campbell	NHS Forth Valley
Dr Pat Carragher	CHAS
Andy Carver	British Heart Foundation Scotland
Rev Stuart Coates	Strathcarron Hospice
John Deighan	Catholic Parliamentary Office
Isabel Dosser	Napier University
Dr Derek Doyle	Scottish Partnership for Palliative Care
Dr Rosalie Dunn	NHS Lanarkshire
Francis Edwards	NHS Grampian
Shirley Fife	NHS Lothian
Tom Gault	St Andrew's Hospice
John Gerrie	St Margaret of Scotland Hospice
Ann Gourlay	NHS Tayside
Evonne Gourlay	St Margaret of Scotland Hospice
Anna Grady	Prince & Princess of Wales Hospice
Shelley Gray	LTCAS
Irene Hillsden	NHS Tayside
Dr Elizabeth Ireland	SGHD
Bill Kerr	St Columba's Hospice
Kate Lennon	NHS Greater Glasgow & Clyde
Jean Leslie	NHS Fife
Elaine MacLean	Care Commission
Jacquie Malcolm	St Margaret of Scotland Hospice
Claire Murphy	St Margaret of Scotland Hospice
Hannah McCulloch	Scottish Disability Equality Forum
Dorothy McElroy	Ardgowan Hospice

Present (cont.)	Maria McGill Edward McGuigan Penny McKee Irene McKie Gordon McLaren Tricia Meldrum Ashleigh Moody Dr Bill O'Neill Dr Euan Paterson Ros Scott Helen Simpson Dr Chris Sugden Elizabeth Thomas Diane Thomson Janet Trundle Professor John Welsh Anne Willis Dr Stanley Wright Dan Wynn	Highland Hospice St Margaret of Scotland Hospice Retired GP Strathcarron Hospice NHS Fife Audit Scotland Prince & Princess of Wales Hospice Scottish Primary Care Cancer Group RCGP Children's Hospice Association Scotland ACCORD Hospice St Andrew's Hospice St Margaret of Scotland Hospice Wyeth Pharmaceuticals NHS Greater Glasgow & Clyde NHS Greater Glasgow & Clyde Marie Curie Hospice, Edinburgh NHS Forth Valley GMC Scotland
In attendance:	Pauline Britton Eric Chen Susan Diotaiuti Pat Wallace	Scottish Partnership for Palliative Care Scottish Partnership for Palliative Care Scottish Partnership for Palliative Care Scottish Partnership for Palliative Care
Apologies:	Aileen Anderson Gill Chadwick Margaret Colquhoun Joyce Dunlop Dr Cameron Fergus Kirsty Freeland Gillian Hailstones Johanna Jarvis Trudy Lafferty Susan Morrison Prof Scott Murray Elaine Stevens Bill Stewart Mollie Tevendale	The Ayrshire Hospice NHS Western Isles St Columba's Hospice Roy Castle Lung Cancer Foundation NHS Borders Association of Palliative Care Social Workers Macmillan Cancerbackup Wyeth Pharmaceuticals St Vincent's Hospice NHS Highland University of Edinburgh RCN Palliative Nursing Group Cancer Support Scotland (Tak Tent) NHS Fife

1. Welcome and apologies

The Convener, Michael McMahon MSP welcomed everyone to the meeting especially speakers Roseanna Cunningham MSP for Perth, Jacquie Malcolm, Nurse Lecturer, St Margaret of Scotland Hospice, Dr Elizabeth Ireland, National Clinical Lead for Palliative Care at the Scottish Government and Professor John Welsh, Professor of Palliative Medicine, NHS Greater Glasgow & Clyde.

MSPs attending included Helen Eadie MSP Dunfermline East, Cathy Jamieson MSP Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley, Ian McKee MSP Lothians, Dr Richard Simpson MSP Mid Scotland and Fife and David Thomson MSP Highlands and Islands.

Apologies were noted as above.

Action

2. Minutes of previous meetings:

The minutes of the previous meetings held on Wednesday 11 June 2008 and Wednesday 8 October 2008 were adopted as true records of the meetings. (Proposed: Rev Stuart Coates; Seconded: Maria McGill.)

3. Matters arising from Wednesday 11 June 2008:

3.1 Lymphoedema update (item 4.1)

The Convener reminded members that at an event in May 2008 to launch the findings of the lymphoedema service mapping project Nicola Sturgeon, Cabinet Secretary for Health and Wellbeing, had given the opening address and had announced that NHSQIS had agreed to re-issue for Scotland the International Consensus Document *Best practice for the management of lymphoedema* and was planning an event around this in 2008.

To date no further information had been issued and details would be circulated to members when available.

It was agreed that this item could now be removed from agenda in the meantime. However should any issues pertinent to the mapping project arise in the future this item would be revisited.

ACTION: To be removed from the agenda

PB

3.2 Reduction in the cost of prescription charges (item 7.1)

The Convener reported that as from 1 April 2008 the first phase in the abolition of prescription charges in Scotland had come into force, when the cost of a single prescription item had been lowered from £6.85 to £5.

From 1 April 2009 the cost would be reduced to £4.00.

The Government intended to abolish all prescription charges by April 2011.

It was agreed that this item could now be removed from agenda in the meantime.

ACTION: To be removed from the agenda

PB

3.3 Members' business debate on motion S3M-1452, in the name of Jeremy Purvis, on choices for people coming to the end of terminal illness, Wednesday 26 March 2008 (item 7.2)

The Convener reported that focus of media attention after this debate was mostly about MSP Margo MacDonald who had Parkinson's disease. In July 2008, a programme *BBC Scotland Investigates: Margo MacDonald - my right to die* had been screened in Scotland.

This programme had been shown again on 8 December in a UK-wide edition of *Panorama* under the title *Panorama – I'll die when I choose*. Mrs MacDonald had launched a consultation for her proposed *End of Life Choices (Scotland) Bill* earlier that same day. Mrs MacDonald needed the support of 18 MSPs to introduce her proposed Bill.

He went on to report that a further Cross Party Group meeting had been

arranged for Wednesday 4 February 2009 in Committee Room 3 at 5.45 pm to look at the proposed Bill. Mrs MacDonald and Dr David Jeffrey, Honorary Senior Lecturer in Palliative Medicine at the University of Edinburgh, former Palliative Care Consultant, NHS Borders and former Chair of the Ethics Committee of the Association of Palliative Medicine would present opposing points of view as a forerunner to discussion at the meeting. Attendance would be on a 'first come first served' basis as numbers were restricted to 54 in total due to the size of the room allocated.

4. Matters arising from the meeting of Wednesday 8 October 2008:

4.1 International perspectives on palliative care from economically developing countries (item 3)

The Convener reported that the proposed meeting was still planned but had not taken place yet due to MSP Patricia Ferguson (Convener of the Cross Party Group in the Scottish Parliament on International Development) being absent due to a long-term illness and also the inability to co-ordinate diaries. It was hoped to get the meeting pulled together over the next few weeks.

5. Presentations and discussion:

The Convener then handed over to Dr Elizabeth Ireland and Professor John Welsh for their joint presentation on *Living and Dying Well*, a national action plan for palliative and end of life care in Scotland. Questions and discussions followed.

On behalf of the group, the Convener thanked Dr Ireland and Professor Welsh for their very informed presentation and for responding to ensuing questions.

Attached as appendices 1 and 2 respectively is a copy of the *Living and Dying Well* presentation and subsequent notes from the discussion.

Roseanna Cunningham MSP and Jacquie Malcolm led a discussion around the *Proposed Palliative Care (Scotland) Bill* which was launched on 17 November 2008, notes from which are attached as appendix 3.

On behalf of the group, the Convener thanked Ms Cunningham and Ms Malcolm for leading the discussion and for responding to ensuing questions.

The Convener reminded members that the Cross Party Group had been included in the list of organisations to be consulted by Ms Cunningham on her Proposed Palliative Care (Scotland) Bill.

A wide range of views had been expressed at the meeting, and these, together with the views of members not present, would be reflected in the consultation response which the Convener had been asked to submit on behalf of the Cross Party Group. Views reflected in the minute of the current meeting would be included in the response and the Partnership on behalf of the Convener would circulate an email to all members inviting additional comments. Replies would then be forwarded to the Convener's office for collation.

ACTION: The Convener and the Partnership to take forward

The Group agreed that it would contribute to the consultation on MSP Margo MacDonald's proposed end of life choices Bill also.

MMcM
PB/PW/

7. Any other competent business:

There was no other competent business on this occasion.

8. Date of next meeting:

- Wednesday 4 February 2009 at 5.45 pm in Committee Room 3